

The EU28 dumping of cereals, dairy and meat to the ESA-4 in 2016 Jacques Berthelot (jacques.berthelot4@wanadoo.fr), November 13, 2017

The ESA-4 EPA (Economic Partnership Agreement) was signed by four countries -Madagascar, Mauritius, Seychelles and Zimbabwe – in August 2009 and is provisionally applied since 14 May 2012. It was also initialled but not signed by the Comoros and Zambia. In January 2013, the European Parliament gave its consent to the agreement. But the ESA-4 groups only a small part of the 16 COMESA countries with which the EU began to negotiate an EPA in February 2004 – the other 12 being Burundi, Kenya, Uganda, Rwanda (these four will soon after form the East African Community with Tanzania while remaining in COMESA), Comoros, Djibouti, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Malawi, DR of Congo, Sudan and Zambia. Furthermore there are 19 Member States (MS) in the official COMESA established in 1994, the other MS being Egypt, Lybia and Swaziland. And the DG Trade is still considering that an EPA could be concluded with 11 COMESA MS, including the Comoros, Djibouti, Ethiopia, Eritrea, Malawi, Sudan and Zambia. The ESA-4 EPA is considered as an interim EPA although not a regional one. Each ESA-4 Member States (MS) has its own schedule and degree of liberalization for its imports from the EU, going from 80% in Zimbabwe to 81% in Madagascar, 96% in Mauritius and 98% in the Seychelles. Mauritius choose to open up its market to the EU almost completely (95.6%) by 2022 under its open trade policy although liberalisation is still gradual with only 53.7% of EU imports liberalised by 2017.

The present analysis is limited to an in-depth assessment of the EU28 subsidies to its exports of cereals and dairy to the EPA-4 in 2016, with a rapid mention of those to meats and eggs.

A preliminary observation is that financial year 2016 was the first year of full implementation of all the schemes under the reformed structure of direct payments as decided in the 2013 CAP reform. The main schemes are the single area payment scheme (SAPS), the basic payment scheme (BPS), the payment for agricultural practices beneficial for the climate and the environment, the redistributive payment and the payment for young farmers.

I – The EU dumping of cereal products to the ESA-4 in 2016

If, on the one hand, the new CAP implemented in 2016 has reduced by 9.4% the amount of total decoupled direct payments in relation to 2014, on the other hand the EU28 production of cereals was also lower by 9.4% (of which by 20% in France) in relation to 2014 so that the subsidy per tonne of cereal should be about the same. The more so as we did not take into account several components of the second pillar of the CAP on rural development and the so-called *de minimis* aids which are not notified to the EU Commission in the State aids, but which have been significant in the last years, and particularly in 2016, for cereals and milk, notably in France.

Table 1 and table 2 present the EU28 exports of raw and processed cereals to the ESA-4 EPA Member States (MS) in 2016: Madagascar, Mauritius, Seychelles, Zimbabwe. The dumping rate in calculated as the ratio of subsidies to the export value of raw cereals equivalent (RCE) of processed products. SOL calculated in May 2015 that the subsidy per tonne of cereals was

of 66.75 €/t in 2014 in the EU15 minus Germany, of which 59.81 €/t for direct aids and 6.94% for transversal coupled subsidies to cereals (for the share they represent in the value of total agricultural production)¹ and of €60.35 per tonne taking into account the lower subsidy/t of Germany and the new MS.

But Eurostat data allow to identify the specific EU28 MS having exported cereals products (raw cereals and processed cereals in RCE to the ESA-4 in 2016 as well as the ESA-4 MS having imported these products.

Table 1 shows that the EU exports of raw cereals in quantity were of 152,632 tonnes (t), of which 63.9% going to Mauritius and 36% to Zimbabwe

Table 1 – EU28 Member States exports of raw cereals to the ESA-4 in 2016

In 100 kg	wheat	maize	rice	other cereals	Total raw cereals
EU28	1425196	100650	464	14	1526324
		Of which to the E	SA-4 Member State	S	
Mauritius	975500		204	10	975714
Zimbabwe	449695	100000			549695
Madagascar		650	125		775
Seychelles	1		135	2	138
		Of which fro	m the EU28 MS		
Belgium			32	2	34
Bulgaria	3399				3399
Czech Rep.					
Germany	30000		12	4	30016
Denmark					
Estonia					
Spain			38		38
Finland	975500	650	174	8	976332
France	1				1
United Kingdom					
Greece					
Croatia					
Ireland					
Italy			208		208
Lithuania	52500				52500
Latvia					
Malta					
Netherlands		·			
Poland	363796				363796
Portugal					
Romania		100000			100000
Slovakia			36		36
Slovenia		•			· ·

Table 2 shows the EU28 exports of processed cereal products in quantity.

Table 3 shows that the EU28 exports of processed cereals in RCE were of 50,161 t – of which 61.6% going to Madagascar, 27.8% to Mauritius, 5.5% to the Seychelles and 5.1% to Zimbabwe –, so that total raw and processed cereals in RCE were of 202,793 t, of which 55% going to Mauritius, 28.4% to Zimbabwe, 15.3% to Madagascar and 1.4% to the Seychelles.

The RCE rates are taken from the existing literature and the only issue concerns the cereals preparations of code 19, for which the usual RCE rate is 1.25. But the subcode 190110 concerns infant formulas and 19019099 fat-filled milk powder resulting from the addition to skimmed milk powder (or LFMP) of solid vegetable oil (palm or copra), cheaper than milk fat (butter or cream). If these two subcodes are mostly composed of milk powder, they contain also cereals for about 40% of their weight so that the remaining quantity of code 19 has a RCE rate of 1.0357.

¹ SOL, Reappraisal of the UE dumping on cereals to West Africa from 2006 to 2014, 28 May 2015, https://www.sol-asso.fr/articles-de-2015/; SOL, The subsidies to the EU exports of cereal products to West Africa in 2015 and 2016, March 17, 2017, https://www.sol-asso.fr/analyses-politiques-agricoles-jacques-b-2/

Table 2 – EU28 Member States exports of processed cereal products to ESA-4 in 2016

	1101	1102	1103	1104	1107	1108	1109	19	190110	19019099	2203	2208
	wheat flour	Other flours	groats	other processed	malt	cereal starch	gluten	cereals preparations	Infant formula	cereal part	beer	spirits*
EU28	49981	169	6053	2043	220796	26	1462	115283	12121	20306	30057	16721
					Of which to	the ESA-4 I	Member State	es				
Mauritius	212	119	179	1871	33370	10	862	67895	6401	6938	7980	11461
Zimbabwe		11		120			600	12684	1322	10359	1	1503
Madagascar	49513	32	5873	46	178076	16		26178	3785	1975	3193	264
Seychelles	256	7	1	6	9350			8526	613	1034	18883	3493
					Of wh	ich from the	EU28 MS					
Belgium	16	11	1	6	164035			5796	223	4232	546	170
Bulgaria								1258				
Czech Rep.								880		3		4
Germany	511			120	9515	10		1354		75	305	608
Denmark								332		24	255	3
Estonia											380	
Spain		2	1447	9				2043	9	712	12	9
France	39476	135	4530	42	35096		862	65372	11109	6202	956	4102
Un.Kingdom			21	1862	11623			12353	3	255	23	9403
Greece								107				
Croatia								188		188		
Ireland								6711	191	6441		
Italy	368	20	54			16		12733		39		
Lithuania								379				
Latvia								72				
Malta								799				
Netherlands	10	1		4	527		600	3469	586	1974	25127	2422
Poland								807		85	1117	
Portugal								630		76	1335	
Romania	9600											
Sweden											1	
Slovakia												
Slovenia						1			-		61	1

Source: Eurostat. * spirits: whisky, gin & genever, vodka

Table 3 – EU28 Member States exports of processed cereals in RCE to ESA-4 in 2016

		_		10111001	~	271 P O 1	- O- P	10000000						
	1101	1102	1103	1104	1107	1108	1109	19	190110	19019099	2203	2208	All processed	All cereals
	wheat flour	other flours	groats	other processed	malt	cereal starch	gluten	cereals preparations	Infant formula	cereal part	beer	spirits*		
RCE rate	1.33	1.33	1.33	1.02	1.15	1.18	10	1,0357	0.4	0,4	0.17	1.12		
EU28	66474,7	224.8	8050,5	2083,9	253915.4	30.7	14620	119398,6	4848.4	8122.4	5109.7	18727,5	501606.5	2027929
2020	00111,1	LL 1,0	0000,0	2000,0	200010,1			4 Member States	10.10,1	0.22,	0.00,	10121,0	00.000,0	202,020
Mauritius	282	158.3	238,1	1908,4	38375,5	11,8	8620	70318,9	3200,5	2775,2	1356,6	12836,3	139441,4	1115155
Zimbabwe	0	14.6	0	122.4	0	0	6000	13136.8	661	4143.6	0.2	1683.4	25629.8	575324.8
Madagascar	65852,3	42,6	7811,1	46,9	204787,4	18,9	0	27112,6	1892,5	790	542.8	295,7	308814,2	309589,2
Seychelles	340,5	9,3	1,3	6.1	10752,5	0	0	8830.4	306,5	413,6	3210,1	3912,2	27721,2	27859,2
						Of w	hich from th	ne EU28 MS					,	
Belgium	21,3	14,6	1,3	6,1	188640,3	0	0	6002,9	89,2	1692,8	82,8	190,4	196751,7	196785,7
Bulgaria								1302,9	0				1302,9	4701,9
Czech Rep.								911,4	0	1,2		4,5	917,1	917,1
Germany	679,6	0	0	122,4	10942,3	11,8	0	1402,3		30	51,9	681	13921,2	43937,2
Denmark								343,9		9,6	43,4	3,4	400,2	400,2
Estonia											64,6		64,6	64,6
Spain		2,7	1924,5	9,2	0	0	0	2115,9	3,6	284,8	2	10,1	4352,8	4390,8
France	52503,1	179,6	6024,9	42,8	40360,4	0	8620	67705,8	4443,6	2480,8	162,5	4594,2	187117,7	1163450
Un.Kingdom			27,9	1899,2	13366,5	0	0	12794					38726,1	38727,1
Greece								110,8					110,8	110,8
Croatia										75,2			75,2	75,2
Ireland								6950,6	76,4	2576,4			9603,4	9603,4
Italy	489,4	26,6	71,8	0	0	18,9	0	13187,6		15,6			13809,9	14017,9
Lithuania								392,5					392,5	52892,5
Latvia								74,6					74,6	74,6
Malta								827,5					827,5	827,5
Netherlands	13,3	1,3	0	4,1	606,1	0	6000	3592,8	234,4	789,6	4271,6	2712,6	18225,8	18225,8
Poland								835,8	0	34	189,9		1059,7	364855,7
Portugal								652,5	0	30,4	227		909,8	909,8
Romania	12768												12768	112768
Sweden											0,2		0,2	0,2
Slovakia									0	21,6			21,6	21,6
Slovenia		l	l	1							10,4		10,4	10,4

On the 202,730 t of total RCE, 144,662 t were exported by the EU14 (EU15-Germany) which, for a subsidy/t of $66.75 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{ℓ}}/t$, give total subsidies of $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}9.656 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$. The EU13 of new MS exported 53,713 t with $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}2.832 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ (average subsidy of $52.7 \mbox{\ensuremath{$\ell$}}/t$) and Germany exported 4,394 t with $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}2.250 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ of subsidies (average subsidy of $56.6 \mbox{\ensuremath{$\ell$}}/t$). So that total subsidies of exported raw and processed cereals to the ESA-4 were of $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}12.739 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ – of which $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}7.006 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ to Mauritius, $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}3.614 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ to Zimbabwe, $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}1.945 \ \mbox{\ensuremath{M}}$ to Madagascar and $\mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}175,023$ to the Seychelles –, with an average subsidy of $62.82 \mbox{\ensuremath{$\xi$}}/t$ of RCE and an average dumping rate of 17.7%.

II – Subsidies to extra-EU28 exports of dairy products to the ESA-4 in 2016

In 2011, the University of Wageningen produced a milk report for the European Commission presenting decoupled aid per tonne of milk in 2007 for all EU27 MS. Since decoupled aid from the SPS (single payment scheme, now BPS, basic payment scheme) for the EU15 countries (plus Slovenia and Malta which have opted for SPS) are fixed – even if they have been reduced by a modulation but largely compensated for milk by special aids under Article 68 of the 2009 Health Check, plus storage aids and crisis aid since 2015, they remain valid in 2016. The more so as, according to OECD data for 2016 the EU non-product specific subsidies (on agricultural insurances, loans, fuel, investments, promotion and marketing and an estimate on irrigation) attributable to milk (accounting for 13.4% of the whole agricultural production value) were of €1.092 billion. However the ten EU12 countries (of which Bulgaria and Romania which joined the EU on 1 January 2007) adopted the SAPS (single area payment scheme), which was multiplied by 3.7 from 2007 (€2.082 bn) to 2015 (€7.770 bn) so that it is reasonable to estimate at least at €35/t the decoupled aid from those countries which did not reached this level in 2007 (Slovakia did). This results in an average subsidy of 49.79 euros per tonne of milk for the EU28.

However, Wageningen University did not take into account the feed subsidies included in subsidies to cereals, oilseed meals and protein crops (COPs) of European origin consumed by dairy cows². These subsidies were shown to be €17 per tonne of milk, based on 2010 data from the Tallage report³ and a study made in 2012 for lawyers⁴, implying a total subsidy per tonne of milk equivalent €66.79. A study on export subsidies for poultry meat to SADC⁵ has shown that the WTO requires developed countries to notify subsidies to feed, which they refuse. And, although the EU says it does not subsidize its exports as it has not used export refunds since 2014, its domestic subsidies also benefit to its exported products with the same dumping effect, even if most of these subsidies, supposedly decoupled from the level of production, are unduly notified in the WTO green box.

Before evaluating subsidies on exports of all dairy products, it is necessary to start with those to milk powder to identify the conversion rate in tonnes of milk equivalent (TME) of code 0402 on concentrated milk of the Harmonized System (HS). It groups milk powder corresponding to subheadings 040210, 040221 and 040229 and liquid condensed milk of subheadings 040291 and 040299. Milk powder is also included in sub-codes 190110 and 19019099, but as they do not belong to code 0402, they will be dealt with separately below. First we subtract liquid condensed milk (subheadings 040291 and 040299) from code 0402 to obtain total milk powder. The fat milk powder (FMP) groups subcodes 04022191, 04022199, 04022991 and 04022999. The low-fat milk powder (LFMP) is obtained by difference between the total milk powder and the FMP. The Italian consulting firm CLAL estimates the TME rate of 1 kg of fat powder (FMP) at 7.81 kg and the TME rate of LFMP, which is not necessarily totally skimmed, at 10.72⁶. And the French Ministry of Agriculture estimates the TME rate of condensed liquid milk at 2,332⁷. However the following tables have kept the data per 100 kg given by Eurostat to avoid the

 $^{^2\} http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/sites/agriculture/files/evaluation/market-and-income-reports/2011/dairy-sector/fulltext_en.pdf$

³ Tallage, *Modelling of feed consumption in the European Union*, November 2009, a report prepared for DG Agriculture for which "the study provided a comprehensive overview of feed consumption in the EU": http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/analysis/external/feed/index en.htm

⁴ J. Berthelot, *The EU feed subsidies to dairy products*, July 6, 2012, extract of a report for lawyers.

⁵ The EU28 subsidies on its exports of poultry meat and eggs to SADC in 2016, SOL, March 24, 2017, https://www.sol-asso.fr/analyses-politiques-agricoles-jacques-b-2/

⁶ http://www.clal.it/en/?section=dairyPROD_DWT_me

⁷ http://agriculture.gouv.fr/sites/minagri/files/documents/pdf/Coefficients_Techniques_Lait_cle8e1393.pdf

conversion in tonnes given that some MS exports are low. Table 4 shows that the average TME of code 0402 was of 10.095: 39,652 TME over 3,928 tonnes (t).

Table 4 – Tonnes of milk equivalents (TME) of extra-EU28 exports of milk powder to ESA-4 in 2016

Austria 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	1 autc 4	Tomics			,	or cana-	12020 слр			EI TO ESA-	+ III 2010			
Belgium														
Mauritius														
Mauritius	EU28 t	39279	1242	38037				37925,4	355700,3	393625,7	396522			
Zimbabwe 6588 6588 6588 6588 6588 6588 101673 130,6 1975,9 109054,6 111030,5 111161,1														
Madagascar 10482 56 10426 253 10173 130,6 1975,9 109054,6 111030,5 111161,1	Mauritius		1153		4286		2688,8	33473,7	, .					
Sevchelles 864 33 831 315 516 77 2460.2 5531.5 7991.7 80.68.7	Zimbabwe													
Austria 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Madagascar	10482		10426			130,6			111030,5	111161,1			
Austria Belgium 8844 8844 88 8756 687,3 93864,3 94551,6	Seychelles	864	33	831				2460,2	5531,5	7991,7	80,68,7			
Belgium					Of v	which from the E	U28 MS							
Czech Rep. 0	Austria					0	0	0	0	0	0			
Germany 664 664 664 664 0 7118,1	Belgium	8844		8844	88	8756		687,3	93864,3	94551,6	94551,6			
Denmark 3367 3360 3360 16,3 0 36019,2 36019,2 36035,5	Czech Rep.	0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0			
Spain	Germany	664		664		664		0	7118,1	7118,1	7118,1			
Finland France 12954 395 12559 1 12558 921,1 7,8 134621,8 134629,6 13550,7 Unit-Kingdom 3056 3056 0 32760,3 0	Denmark	3367		3360		3360	16,3	0	36019,2	36019,2	36035,5			
France 12954 395 12559 1 12558 921,1 7,8 134621,8 134629,6 13550,7 Unit-Kingdom 3056 3056 0 32760,3 0 <td>Spain</td> <td>44</td> <td></td> <td>44</td> <td>17</td> <td>27</td> <td></td> <td>132,8</td> <td>289,4</td> <td>422,2</td> <td>422,2</td>	Spain	44		44	17	27		132,8	289,4	422,2	422,2			
Unit-Kingdom 3056 3056 3056 3056 0 32760,3	Finland								·	·				
Greece 0 <td>France</td> <td>12954</td> <td>395</td> <td>12559</td> <td>1</td> <td>12558</td> <td>921,1</td> <td>7,8</td> <td>134621,8</td> <td>134629,6</td> <td>135550,7</td>	France	12954	395	12559	1	12558	921,1	7,8	134621,8	134629,6	135550,7			
Croatia 0 </td <td>Unit-Kingdom</td> <td>3056</td> <td></td> <td>3056</td> <td></td> <td>3056</td> <td></td> <td>0</td> <td>32760,3</td> <td>32760,3</td> <td>32760,3</td>	Unit-Kingdom	3056		3056		3056		0	32760,3	32760,3	32760,3			
Hungary	Greece					0	0	0	0	0	0			
Ireland 2119 2119 2119 0 22715,7	Croatia					0	0	0	0	0	0			
Italy 2 2 2 0 21,4	Hungary					0	0	0	0	0	0			
Lithuania 0	Ireland	2119		2119		2119		0	22715,7	22715,7	22715,7			
Lithuania 0 0 0 0 0 0 Netherlands 7739 840 6899 4749 2150 1958,9 37089,7 23048 60137,7 62096,6 Poland 0 0 2915,8 <td>Italy</td> <td>2</td> <td></td> <td>2</td> <td></td> <td>2</td> <td></td> <td>0</td> <td>21,4</td> <td>21,4</td> <td>21,4</td>	Italy	2		2		2		0	21,4	21,4	21,4			
Poland 0 2915,8	Lithuania					0		0	0	0	0			
Portugal 272 272 2915,8	Netherlands	7739	840	6899	4749	2150	1958,9	37089,7	23048	60137,7	62096,6			
Roumania 0 0 0 0 0 Sweden 218 218 218 2337 2337 2337 Slovenia 3 3 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 3 2 2 3 2 3 2 3 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 2 3 3 2 3 3 2 3 3 2 3 3 2 3 3 2 3	Poland					0		,						
Roumania 0 0 0 0 0 0 Sweden 218 218 218 2337 2337 2337 Slovenia 337 338 <td>Portugal</td> <td>272</td> <td></td> <td>272</td> <td></td> <td>272</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>2915.8</td> <td>2915.8</td> <td>2915,8</td>	Portugal	272		272		272			2915.8	2915.8	2915,8			
Sweden 218 218 218 2337 2337 Slovenia 337 237 237 237						0					0			
Slovenia Slo		218		218		218				2337	2337			
		2.0		2.0		2.0	İ		2001	2001	2001			
SIOVAKIA I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	Slovakia													

Table 5 presents all the quantities in 100 kg of the EU28 dairy exports to ESA-4 in 2016.

Table 5 – Extra-EU28 dairy exports per Member State to ESA-4 EPA in 2016

	1 abite 3 - 1	Exira-EO	20 uan y	cxports	ber me	moet Sta	ic io esa.	4 EFA III 20	710	
In 100 kg	0401	0402	0403	0404	0405	0406	190110	19019099	2105	3501
EU28	58863	39279	5380	5967	7830	14653	12121	20306	5304	175
				Of which to	the ESA-4 Mem	ber States				
Mauritius	21679	21345	422	252	3564	10086	6401	6938	4335	108
Zimbabwe		6588		750	202	233	1322	10359	10	1
Madagascar	26056	10482	48	4953	2953	2092	3785	1975	577	66
Seychelles	11128	864	4910	12	1111	2242	613	1034	382	
				Of whice	ch from the EU2	8 MS				
Austria						386				
Belgium	8643	8844	148		389	2	223	4232	122	
Czech Rep.	0	0	82	10	15	30		3		
Germany	20785	664	2122		45	421		75	10	2
Denmark	165	3367			342	627		24		
Spain		44	1803		35	933	9	712		
France	17818	12954	401	4699	5084	7494	11109	6202	5162	98
Un.Kingdom		3056		4		788	3	255	3	
Greece						1				
Croatia								188		
Hungary				4				0		
Ireland	910	2119			1468	1363	191	6441		
Italy	9	2	4			1090		39	1	
Lithuania						93				
Netherlands	1304	7739	690	1000	452	1369	586	1974		
Poland	4065		130	250		26		85	5	75
Portugal	13	272						76	1	
Romania						30				
Sweden		218								
Slovenia	3657									
Slovakia	1494									

Source: Eurostat; 0401: milk and cream; 0402: concentrated milk; 0403: yogurt; 0404: whey; 0405: butter; 0406: cheese; 190110: infant formulas; 19019099: LFMP enriched with solid vegetable oil; 2105: ice cream; 3501: casein

Table 6 presents the EU28 dairy exports in milk equivalent (ME) and deduct the subsidies to the ESA-4 MS given the weight of each EU28 MS in total exports and their specific subsidy per 100 kg. Total subsidies were of €6.406 M, of which €3.162 M to Mauritius, €1.748 M to Madagascar, €932,329 to Zimbabwe and €564,171 to the Seychelles.

Table 6 – Subsidies to extra-EU28 dairy exports in ME: to ESA-4 EPA in 2016

100 kg	0401	0402	0403	0404	0405	0406	190110	19019099	2105	3501	Total	Sub/100kg	Subsidv.	FOB value	DR
TME/t	2,23	10,095	1,66	2	11,15	7,96	3	5,36	0,84	12,3					
EU28	131264,5	396521,5	8930,8	11934	87304,5	116637,9	36363	108840,2	4455,4	2152,5	904405,1	7,08	6406158	41090544	15,6%
Of which to the ESA-4 Member States															
Mauritius	48344,2	215477,8	700,5	504	39738,6	80284,6	19203	37187,7	3641,4	1328,4	446410,1		3162050		
Zimbabwe		66505,9	0	1500	2252,3	1854,7	3966	55524,2	8,4	12,3	131623,8		932329		
Madagascar	58104,9	105815,8	79,7	9906	32926	16652,3	11355	10586	484,7	811,8	246722,1		1747603		
Seychelles	24815,4	8722,1	8150,6	24	12387,7	17846,3	1839	5542,2	320,9		79648,21		564171		
						0	f which from	the EU28 MS	;						
Austria						3072,6					3072,6	6,6	20279,2	147592	13,7%
Belgium	19273,9	89280,2	245,7	0	4337,4	15,9	669	22683,5	102,5	0	136608	6,8	928934,4	2982182	31,1%
Czech Rep.	0	0	136,1	20	167,3	238,8	0	16,1			578,3	5,2	3007,2	29529	10,2%
Germany	46350,7	6703,1	3522,5	0	501,8	3351,2	0	402	8,4	24,6	60864,1	7,9	480826,4	1521430	31,6%
Denmark	368	33989,9	0	0	3813,3	4990,9	0	128,6			43290,7	7,4	320351,2	1339411	23,9%
Spain		444,2	2993	0	390,3	7426,7	27	3816,3			15097,4	5,1	76996,7	909516	8,5%
France	39734,1	130770,6	665,7	9398	56686,6	59652,2	33327	33242,7	4336,1	1205,4	369018,5	7,7	2841442	24126142	11,8%
Un.Kingdom		30850,3	0	8	0	6272,5	9	1366,8	2,5		38509,1	5,4	207949,1	1132193	18,4%
Greece						8					8	5,2	41,6	1313	3,2%
Croatia								1007,7			1007,7	4,5	4534,7	24862	18,2%
Hungary				8				0			8	3,9	31,2	5455	0,6%
Ireland	2029,3	21391,3	0	0	16368,2	10849,5	573	34523,8			85735,1	7,6	651586,8	3487302	18,7%
Italy	20,1	20,2	6,6	0	0	8676,4	0	209	0,8		8933,9	5,7	50923,2	681316	7,5%
Lithuania						740,3					740,3	5,2	3849,6	32797	11,7%
Netherlands	2907,9	78125,2	1145,4	2000	5039,8	10897,2	1758	10580,6			112454,2	5,7	640988,9	3941219	16,3%
Poland	9065	0	215,8	500	0	207	0	455,6	4,2	922,5	11370	5,2	59124	306264	19,3%
Portugal	29	2745,8	0	0	0	0	0	407,4	0,8		3183	4,5	14323,5	127251	11,3%
Romania						238,8					238,8	5,2	1241,8	19520	6,4%
Sweden	, and the second	2200,7									2200,7	7,5	16505,3	48510	34%
Slovenia	8155,1										8155,1	7,1	57901,2	149610	38,7%
Slovakia	3361,6										3331,6	7,6	25320,2	77130	,32,8%

Conclusion

The EU28 subsidies to its exports of meats and eggs to ESA-4 MS in 2016 were low so that it is not worthwhile devoting a detailed analysis. They accounted for around €1.210 M, of which €0.830 M for pig meat and preparations, €0.246 for poultry meat and preparations and €0.133 M for bovine meat and preparations.

Consequently total EU28 subsidies to its exports of cereals, dairy, meats and eggs to ESA-4 have reached $\[\in \] 20.355 \]$ M in 2016, of which $\[\in \] 10.803 \]$ M to Mauritius (53.1% of total), $\[\in \] 4.547$ to Zimbabwe (22.5% of total), $\[\in \] 3.731$ to Madagascar (18.3% of total) and $\[\in \] 1.275 \]$ M to the Seychelles (6.3% of total). Given the large disparities in the population of the ESA-4 MS in 2016 (42.401 M inhabitants, of which 24.895 M in Madagascar, 16.150 M in Zimbabwe, 1.262 M in Mauritius and 94,000 in the Seychelles), the average subsidy per inhabitant was of $\[\in \] 0.48$, decreasing from $\[\in \] 13.6$ in the Seychelles to $\[\in \] 8.56$ in Mauritius, $\[\in \] 0.28$ in Zimbabwe and $\[\in \] 0.15$ in Madagascar. Clearly these subsidies do not include those to the other agricultural products exported to the ESA-4, knowing that the decoupled nature of most EU subsidies benefit now to all its agricultural exported products.

If the EU subsidies in 2016 may appear limited, let us compare them with the allocation of the 11^{th} EDF (European Development Fund) to ESA-4 for the average annual EDF of the 7 years from 2014 to 2020 and the average expected annual population during the same period. We see that the average agricultural subsidy (total or per inhabitant) represented 2/3 of the EDF to agriculture and likely close to the same level with the subsidies to all agricultural products. We see that the 11^{th} EDF per inhabitant per year of $\{2.51\}$ for the ESA-4 is even smaller than the average $\{4.1\}$ for all ACPs, which itself corresponds to a small pack of candies.

Table 7 – Comparison of the EU28 agricultural subsidies in 2016with the annual 11th EDF

	Mauritius	Zimbabwe	Madagascar	Seychelles	ESA-4
EDF/year: \$1000	1414	33428	74000	314.3	109156
EDF/agriculture/year: \$1000	0	12570	18570	0	31140
Average population: 1000	1267	16514	25599	95	43475
EDF in \$/year/inhabitant: \$	1.12	2.02	2.89	3.30	2.51
EDF/agriculture/year/inhab: \$	0	0.76	0.73	0	0.72
EU agricul. subs/2016: \$1000	10803	4547	3731	1275	20355
EU agri. subs/inhabitant/2016: \$	8.56	0.28	0.15	13.6	0.48

Source: https://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/countries/mauritius_en; UN population data base, 2017 revision